

Decision Notice

DN 16/2022 Date 27/09/2022

Risk and Resource Model

The Commissioner has decided to approve the new North Yorkshire Fire and Rescue Service Risk and Resource Model 2022-25, subject to stipulations placed on some proposals.

Background

The Commissioner has a statutory duty, set out under the Fire and Rescue Services Act 2004 and outlined in the National Framework for Fire and Rescue Services, to produce and publish an Integrated Risk Management Plan for North Yorkshire Fire and Rescue Service. In North Yorkshire, the Integrated Risk Management Plan is called the Risk and Resource Model (RRM), and the Chief Fire Officer is delegated to prepare the RRM for the Commissioner's approval. The Commissioner also has a statutory duty to consult the public on those aspects of the proposed RRM that may affect fire cover prior to making her decision about its implementation.

Previously, in North Yorkshire the Integrated Risk Management Plan was called the Community Safety Plan. The last one was set in 2016 and ran until the end of March 2021. In March 2021, the then Commissioner extended the life of that Plan by 9 months to the end of December 2021 to reflect the impact of the pandemic and to align with the new Commissioner election cycle, as set out in DN 08/21. However, in July 2021 the then Commissioner determined a further extension of the life of the plan to the end of September 2022, to assure the quality and extent of the available data and provide scope for further analytical and modelling work to be undertaken, as set out in DN 11/21.

In March 2022 the Service published its Community Risk Profile (Appendix 1), based on an extensive methodology (Appendix 2), which underpins the Risk and Resource Model. This is the most comprehensive assessment of risk ever conducted by North Yorkshire Fire and Rescue Service, taking into account not only five years of incident data, but also demographic, socio-economic and infrastructure data, including partner data, to ensure a robust understanding of risk in our communities.

The Service brought proposals for the new Risk and Resource Model to the Commissioner at Executive Board in March 2022. These were based upon a gap analysis of their services and resource modelling versus the risk profile (Appendix 3), and extensive data analysis and resource modelling to identify appropriate solutions set out in a technical proposal document that included an investment plan (Appendix 4). At this meeting, the Commissioner adopted five options to be taken to formal consultation (framed as four proposals given the similarity of the changes proposed at Harrogate and Scarborough), and also determined to include three other aspects of service change which didn't require formal consultation to inform the public about the wider context of change being proposed.

In advance of the formal consultation, a two-week staff engagement period was undertaken by the Service to inform its employees of the proposals to be taken forward. A full formal

consultation was launched on 23 May 2022 and was open for 12 weeks until 14 August 2022. A consultation document was provided (Appendix 5) and the Commissioner, her Office and the Service conducted extensive engagement and publicising to encourage participation. A full report setting out the consultation strategy, activity and results, and the Commissioner's response to the consultation, can be found at Appendix 6. Overall, over 1,400 people were engaged during the consultation across 12 public events; three resident focus groups were held to explore views; the Commissioner met with Councillors, firefighters, and interested parties; and over 1,300 people and organisations responded through the online consultation survey. Throughout the consultation the Commissioner put the questions asked by the public and firefighters to the Service and interrogated their response, scrutinising the detail of the data and evidence set out. The Commissioner also met with the Fire Brigades Union on two occasions during the consultation.

Overall, respondents supported the proposals, although there was no majority in favour of the Huntington proposal. Support was more finely balanced for the proposals which set out a change to response resources at Huntington, Harrogate and Scarborough. The Commissioner put the responses to the Service and asked them to consider whether they change their assessment in any way, or whether mitigations need to be put in place to address concerns. She required that the Service provide a full response to the consultation as part of her decision making. The Service's response and the Chief Fire Officer's recommendation have been set out in Appendix 7, which were provided to the Commissioner at a plenary briefing session on 20 September 2022 at which the Commissioner requested that additional consideration be made regarding the Scarborough proposal.

On 27 September 2022, the Service brought their final recommendation and full Risk and Resource Model 2022-25 for decision of the Commissioner at Executive Board. The Commissioner fully considered the Service's response to the consultation set out in Appendix 7 and set additional direction and stipulations on some proposals. The draft Risk and Resource Model 2022-25 document was considered and areas for development and change discussed and noted. The finalised document will be published in due course and appended to this Decision Notice. It is also noted that enable North Yorkshire resourcing needs to be kept under careful consideration through the Collaboration Steering Group.

The Fire Brigades Union consultation response was received after the close of the consultation and after the deadline for papers for the Executive Board at which the decision was being made. It follows that their response was not considered in those papers. As such, special consideration of their response was made point by point during the Executive Board meeting. A special addendum to the consultation report response will be written to acknowledge the FBU response.

Decision Record

The Commissioner's decision is as follows.

1. That the new Risk and Resource Model 2022-25 setting out the Service's delivery against the Commissioner's Fire and Rescue Plan, its mitigation and response to the risk held in the area, and its delivery against its statutory obligations across prevention, protection, response and resilience be approved and adopted.
2. That the proposal to enhance prevention and protection services and increase resources with additional firefighter and non-firefighter roles be approved and adopted.

- a. The Commissioner has decided that the investment plan set out by the Service at Executive Board in March 2022 should be re-profiled to make the investment into prevention and protection teams permanent at this point.
 - b. That aspirations to grow the Public Safety Service be considered separately.
3. That the proposal to
 - a. extend the Service's current Automatic Fire Alarm policy be approved;
 - b. change the policy on response to automatic fire alarms at low risk premises be approved;
 - c. introduce the ability to charge for attendance to automatic fire alarms be approved;
 - d. remove the requirement to respond on blue lights, and keep fire engines available for redirection to more critical incidents be approved;
 - e. review the pre-determined attendance to automatic fire alarms be approved.
4. That the proposal to change Huntington to an On-call fire station be approved.
 - a. The Commissioner has required that as part of the new performance framework, an ongoing assurance review of On-call response time data be implemented by the Chief Fire Officer, with updates to be provided periodically to the Commissioner, to identify measures to further improve response times.
5. That the proposal to replace the Tactical Response fire engine at Harrogate with an Emergency Rescue fire engine which will be crewed only during peak demand hours be approved.
6. That the proposal to replace the Tactical Response fire engine at Scarborough with an Emergency Rescue fire engine which will be crewed only during peak demand hours be approved, subject to
 - a. Completion to the Commissioner's satisfaction of a full review of the implementation of the change at Harrogate that must demonstrate:
 - i. successful implementation of a new duty system that provides a 24hr shift fire engine and a peak demand fire engine (each duty system can stand alone if required);
 - ii. maintaining the aim of crewing with five on a night-time at Harrogate;
 - iii. limited use of the peak demand fire engine to supplement shortfalls in fire cover other than those identified in the fire cover model;
 - iv. manageable impact on mobilising specialist appliances and support crew with a single appliance model on a night-time.
 - b. Other assurances made to the Commissioner's satisfaction that include:
 - i. resilient night-time On-call availability at surrounding stations;
 - ii. maintaining the aim of crewing with five on a night-time at Scarborough;
 - iii. no changes are identified through Community Risk Profile reviews that demonstrate Scarborough risk has increased;
 - iv. a review of Aerial Ladder Platform pre-determined attendance has taken place and been implemented;

- v. the fire cover model has been reviewed to include cover moves and a revised model has been implemented.
7. That the introduction of a swift water rescue capability at Skipton be expedited.
8. That the Response Principles be adopted.
 - a. That the Service works towards the creation of a response times model, taking into account duty systems and geography, to provide the public of North Yorkshire with meaningful, accurate and localised response standards to help them understand what they should expect.
9. That the Service take forward proposals regarding shift times and self-rostering through employee consultation.
10. That plans to reform, improve and enhance the On-call service in North Yorkshire be progressed to full business case.
 - a. That these plans consider the re-profiling of the investment plan and the requirement for further efficiencies to realise the full scope of these plans.



Zoë Metcalfe
Police, Fire and Crime Commissioner for North Yorkshire

Statutory Officer Advice

Legal, Management and Equality Implications

The Commissioner's Chief Executive and Monitoring Officer, having read this report and having considered such information as has been provided at the time of being asked to express this view, is satisfied that this report does not ask the Commissioner to make a decision which would (or would be likely to) give rise to a contravention of the law.

Financial and Commercial

The Commissioner's Chief Finance Officer and S151 Officer has advised that the proposals set out within the new Risk and Resource Model must be self-financed. As such those areas of investment, such as additional resources into Prevention and Protection, are only affordable through the delivery of the efficiencies that are highlighted through the changes proposed, in particular for Huntington. It is therefore essential that these changes are implemented in a co-ordinated way and the investment is not progressed in isolation.

Investments into both the Public Safety Service and the On-call service, will need to be subject to separate proposals. The affordability of investments into these areas will need to be further assessed, and aligned with, and considered against, the progress of delivery of the efficiencies from the changes proposed at Huntington, Harrogate and Scarborough. In addition to this any proposed investments will also need to take into account the overall financial position of the Fire and Rescue Service, which like many areas of the economy is facing higher levels of inflation pressure from both Pay and Non-Pay areas of expenditure.